

Action Plan to improve and enhance the migratory data production system and data sources in Bulgaria

**Elka Yakimova
Magdalena Kostova
Diana Toteva
Finka Denkova**

National Statistical Institute of Bulgaria



2014

This action plan was developed in the framework of SEEMIG – Managing Migration and its Effects in SEE – Transnational Actions towards Evidence-based Strategies. SEEMIG is a strategic project funded by the European Union’s South-East Europe Programme.

Project code: SEEMIG - SEE/C/0006/4.1/X

Lead Partner: Hungarian Central Statistical Office

The document was developed within the activity *Enhancing data production systems of migration and human capital in the South-East European area* coordinated by the Institute of Social Sciences, Serbia and the Demographic Research Institute at the Hungarian Central Statistical Office.

The information published here reflects the authors’ views and the Managing Authority is not liable for any use that may be made of the information concerned.

© Yakimova, Elka – Kostova, Magdalena – Toteva, Diana – Denkova, Finka
All Rights Reserved.

Information for reproducing excerpts from this report can be found at www.seemig.eu. Inquiries can also be directed to: Demographic Research Institute at the Hungarian Central Statistical Office H-1024 Budapest, Buday László u. 1-3. or by contacting dri-seemig@demografia.hu.

Suggested citation: Yakimova, Elka – Kostova, Magdalena – Toteva, Diana – Denkova, Finka (2014): *Action Plan to improve and enhance the migratory data production system and data sources in Bulgaria*. Action plan developed within the project ‘SEEMIG Managing Migration and Its Effects – Transnational Actions Towards Evidence Based Strategies’. <http://www.seemig.eu/downloads/outputs/SEEMIGActionPlanBulgaria.pdf>

List of acronyms, abbreviations and their English translation

Acronym/ Abbreviation	English translation	Endonym
CPDP	Commission for Personal Data Protection	Комисия за защита на личните данни
INE	National Statistical Institute of Spain	Национална статистическа служба на Испания
ISD	Information System Demography	Информационна система Демография
LFS	Labour Force Survey	Изследване на работната сила
MES	Ministry of Education and Science	Министерство на образованието и науката
MFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs	Министерство на външните работи
MLSP	Ministry of Labour and Social Policy	Министерство на труда и социалната политика
MI	Ministry of Interior	Министерство на вътрешните работи
MRD	Ministry of Regional Development	Министерство на регионалното развитие
NSSI	National Social Security Institute	Национален осигурителен институт
NRA	National Revenue Agency	Национална агенция за приходите
NSCR	National System for Civil Registration	Национална система за гражданска регистрация
NSI	National Statistical Institute	Национален статистически институт
PIN	Personal Identification Number	Единен граждански номер
PR	Population Register	Регистър на населението

1. INTRODUCTION

The main objective of the Action plan presented below is to outline the future developments in the field of data collection, data linkage and production of more accurate and reliable statistics not only on the international migration, but also on the population of the Republic of Bulgaria. The importance of data on international migration and the requirements in respect its quality and reliability have increased as the last are of great value in preparation of adequate strategies for development of the human capital and in particular for elaboration of proper and effective labour market strategies.

The role of the NSI of Bulgaria in the process of improvement of data collection and production of statistics on international migration is quite important. As a government institution fully responsible for the statistical data production, the NSI makes continuous efforts to improve the data provided not only for the national policy making purposes, but for provision of required by the Eurostat and other international organisation.

The added value of European Statistics (as opposed to an agglomeration of national statistics) lies, in particular, in the comparability of the data. Consequently, the Code of Practice states that "Statistics are compiled on the basis of common standards with respect to scope, definitions, units and classifications in the different surveys and sources". This requires efforts of harmonisation with the appropriate level of harmonisation linked to the purpose of the statistics, the data source and the type of data collected.

In Wiesbaden memorandum (adopted by DGINS conference on 28th September 2011) a new conceptual design for household and social statistics was agreed in particular that better access to administrative data, re-use of existing data and access to new data sources are areas to be developed at national and EU level.

For example, for administrative sources, output harmonisation is the only approach feasible in the short and medium term; in the long term, and in particular as regards new data sources, efforts could be undertaken to influence the establishment of the data sources at an early stage, in order to ensure that the concepts used are aligned with the concepts needed for the production of the statistics.

The activities envisaged by the AP are in conformity to the overall data production system in the country and mainly take into consideration the expected future developments in the inter-institutional cooperation. Thus the main efforts in the forthcoming years will be directed to expanding the number of administrative data sources used for statistical purposes and coordination of the activities undertaken by separate government institutions towards harmonisation of definitions, classifications and nomenclatures.

The main targets to be achieved during the next five years in respect the production of migration data are as follows:

1. To increase the number of administrative data sources used for production of statistics on international migration.

2. To make efforts for strengthening of the harmonisation process in usage of unified definitions, classifications and nomenclatures.
3. To support the institutions having legislative initiative in their efforts on introduction of amendments into the national legislation aiming enhancing the registration of Bulgarian citizens residing abroad.
4. Enhancing introduction of contemporary modes for data exchange
5. Large-scale Investigation of the information available at different administrative databases and possibilities to be used for statistical purposes.

2. POSSIBILITIES OF SETTING UP DEVELOPMENTAL DATABASES ON NATIONAL, LOCAL AND TRANSNATIONAL LEVEL

- ***Possible construction of a national developmental database on migration, labour market and human capital***

The NSI of Bulgaria provides a wide range of information on its web site - demographic, labour, economic, business, social services, living conditions, etc.

Through the specialised information system on demography a detailed set of population and demographic indicators are produced, including migration. Detailed results are published at the NSI web site annually, covering not only the total country characteristics, but also regional ones. In addition a set of time series on the main indicators is maintained. Special topics are devoted to life tables and population projections. Detailed census information is also available. Specific users' needs are met at request.

Migration data are available since 2007, containing breakdowns by age and sex. At present, the last cover the country level only. The intended improvement of migration data and especially enlargement the usage of administrative data sources on migration, both immigration and emigration, will contribute to improve the coverage and respectively the quality of information on migration and to better satisfy data users demands. Possibilities will be also created for detailed analysis of migration processes, thus responding better to challenges related to migration. To achieve these goals, the main efforts should be directed to investigation of the migration related information existing in different data owners datasets first and second - combining migration related data from separate datasets into one comprehensive one. As an institution responsible for production of statistics on migration, the NSI of Bulgaria should play leading role in the process of improvement the quality of migration data. For the purpose, the efforts to incorporate additional migration data have to continue, as well as attempts to introduce legislative changes aiming better registration of migration.

The future maintenance and regular updates of the available statistical datasets are considered quite important, as well as inclusion of new data. In this regard, the migration dataset developed in the framework of SEEMIG project is considered an important contribution.

- ***Maintenance of SEEMIG transnational databases beyond SEEMIG's lifespan***

The database elaborated within the SEEMIG project covers different aspects of international migration in SEE area, number of important demographic indicators and data on labour market situation, which creates a possibility to analyse in depth the migration processes in the region as well as its influence on the labour market and human capital. The maintenance of the database beyond the SEEMIG lifespan will be a quite useful for data users and policy makers not only in the countries concerned, but also across the Europe. Maintenance of the existing and possible inclusion of new indicators will contribute to a better understanding of the migration processes in the region and creation of appropriate measures to influence their consequences.

As considerable efforts were put within the project to create the database it will be reasonable not to leave it off but to find an appropriate mode of partnership to continue with adding data on coming

years and to include new one. For the purpose an inter-institutional agreement has to be signed comprising all the countries involved into the SEEMIG project and the respective institutions engaged with data collection. Based on such an agreement the maintenance of the database will be ensured. The database coverage may be even expanded by association of new countries, outside the SEE region that are interested in migration and its effect on labour market.

3. NATIONAL LEVEL ACTIVITIES FOR MIGRATION RELATED DATA SYSTEM IMPROVEMENTS

3.1. Administrative data sources

- ***Legal authorization of the access of the relevant statistical offices/ institution to individual data***

NSI of Bulgaria has good experience in use of administrative data sources for statistical purposes. At present the whole population and demographic statistics is based on administrative records. The information received at NSI is based on person's identification, which allows linkage of records on one and the same person.

The NSI is recognized by the CPDP (Commission for Personal Data Protection) as an administrator of personal data i.e. NSI is given the right to collect, receive and process individual data for statistical purposes.

As a rule, the provision of data from administrative sources is based on agreements signed between the NSI and the institution concerned. The agreements comprise the data to be transmitted, rules for data transmission, terms for data transmission. No direct access to the other institutions databases or information systems is ensured. Data files are exchanged including the needed for statistical purposes information.

Based on special agreement, at present the NSI is provided data by the PR (Population Register) on the number of births, deaths, marriages, divorces, change of address. Also information on persons granted refugee, asylum or humanitarian status and person granted long-term or permanent residence permits is provided. All these are based on PIN numbers and based on the last the information received from the PR is linked to the Information System Demography maintained by the NSI. Thus foreign citizens (third country nationals) residing in the country on permanent basis are included /excluded in /from the population number.

In order to improve data on immigration in the country a new agreement was signed in 2012 between the NSI and the MI (Ministry of Interior). Based on this agreement since the beginning of 2013 the NSI is provided data on immigrants issued residence permits during the year and on EU citizens who have register themselves, dates of entering and leaving the country. Thus a possibility is created the exact length of stay in the country to be calculated and respectively the exact number of immigrants. For the purpose the international criteria for length of stay of 12 months or more is respected in calculation of the number of immigrants and usually resident population.

As the weak side of the statistics on international migration in Bulgaria is the emigration of Bulgarian citizens, numbers of measures were undertaken during the last years to improve the estimates on emigration. There is no a specialised institutional plan on migration issues, but the work on improvement of emigration data is an everyday task of the NSI experts. As a result, since 2010, based on bilateral agreement between the NSI and the NRA (National Revenue Agency), the NSI is provided data on persons exempted from the obligation to pay health insurance contributions. Persons PIN and date of departure/return are received on annual basis at NSI. Information is used to produce better estimates of the number of emigrants.

The above mentioned examples of cooperation between different government institutions prove that even if the information collected by a given institution is not intended for statistical purposes and not for measuring the migration in particular, it can be used by the NSI for production of better estimates of the migration processes and number of migrants.

Considering the above, number of additional possible data sources was already investigated and sources of data on emigration were expanded. For the first time in 2013, information from the National Social Security Institute database on persons receiving their pensions abroad was used. For the purpose an agreement was signed between the two institutions for exchange of information based on person's identification, thus allowing exclusion of persons receiving their pensions i.e. staying abroad for more than one year from the population number. These persons are considered emigrants and respectively were added to the emigrant data.

Also an initiative was started to agree exchange of information between the NSI and the Ministry of Education and Science (Information from the registers of pupils and students is expected to be exchanged). Based on MES data, more precise figures on foreign students in Bulgaria are expected to be received, as well as on Bulgarian students abroad. The information will be accordingly used for production of better international migration estimates.

Being aware about the importance and influence of migration data on the development of demographic situation and the labour market in the country and recognising the necessity to improve the migration data, a specialised inter-institutional working group on migration issues was created by Order of the NSI President including representatives of MI, MFA, MRD, MLSP, NRA, NSSI, MES and SABA. The main task of the working group is to prepare a set of proposals for administrative measures and economic incentives, to guarantee improvement of registration of migration of the Bulgarian citizens. One of the measures written down is to improve the system of exchange of statistical data between different institutions. The last is also included in the 2011-2020 National Strategy on Migration, Asylum and Integration.

As a result of the work of the group a proposal was received from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of Regional Development, NSCR (National System for Civil registration) in regards to the activities of consular offices of the Republic of Bulgaria abroad, regarding the registration of Bulgarian citizens residing abroad.

Quite interesting in this aspect is the proposal of the INE of Spain for exchange of information between EU Member States. What is proposed is the exchange for statistical purposes individual data and not aggregate figures. In the case of Bulgaria, which data are fully based on administrative records such an approach, if adopted, will contribute quite a lot for improvement not only of

migration data, but also of population data as a whole. Certainly, to move in this direction a special legislation at European level is needed that makes possible data transfers between the countries, specifies the data protection issues, data to be transferred, etc.

What concerns the so called “mirror statistics”, at present the NSI cannot fully benefit this data, because just the number of emigrants is not enough to excluded these people from the information system maintained by the NSI, but personal identification of each person.

- ***Steps towards the harmonization of definitions in different migration data sets***

The registers operating in the country are established to satisfy the necessities of separate institution according to their main tasks. Unfortunately, no coordination between the institutions was performed during the process of establishment of different registers. Due to the last, the definitions and nomenclatures used by separate administrative actors are quite different and sometimes impossible to standardize. At present one of the main difficulties met in using data from other institution datasets is due to these discrepancies. That’s why one of the directions in the future work will be to agree with the institutions collecting any migration related data the information to be collected (data format, indicators to be included, classification to be used) in order to allow its use for production of data on migration processes. Questions on unification of information gathered by separate institutions are one of the tasks of the inter-institutional working group on migration issues. To achieve the required unification, representatives of different institution will discuss and adopt all the necessary changes in their own databases, as well as future developmental activities.

To improve the situation, one of the important future directions of work at the NSI will be as an institution responsible for the overall statistical data collection and production in the country to play leading role in adoption and application of one and the same definitions and nomenclatures. For the purpose it is intended to agree the data needed and the definitions applied and nomenclatures used even during the process of establishment of different datasets. As the last requires a lot of continuous efforts on one side and better understanding between institutions on the other, this task is not expected to be finished in five years period, it should be a permanent task aiming establishment and maintenance in a long-term perspective of an integrated system on migration.

- ***Steps towards improving data collection procedure, increase coverage and quality of data, updating the databases***

As already mentioned above the main efforts of the NSI will be directed on expanding the number of administrative data sources used. At the same time, even if new sources are found, the administrative procedures that have to be passes to ensure access to other institutions information systems are time consuming and the process of preparation of agreements for data exchange sometimes takes year or even more. Nevertheless, one of the everyday tasks of the NSI experts is the searching of such information channels.

3.2. Labour Force Survey (LFS)

The main purpose of the Labour force survey is to provide information on the main characteristics of employment and unemployment in the Republic of Bulgaria. Results from the surveys are published in the Bulgarian statistical publications and are periodically sent to analytical and informative units of

international organizations such as EUROSTAT, OECD, ILO, UNESCO, etc. and are published in corresponding international issues.

Since 2003 ad hoc modules, providing more detailed information on characteristics of the labour force, have been included in the Labour force survey - lifelong learning, work organization and working time arrangements, reconciliation of work and family life, transition from work into retirement, accidents at work and work related health problems etc. In 2008 the ad hoc module on the labour market situation of migrants and their immediate descendants was conducted (COMMISSION REGULATION (EC) No 102/2007). Due to the small number of migrants in the population the light version of 2008 ad hoc module was implemented. In 2014 the LFS ad hoc module on the labour market situation of migrants and their immediate descendants is carried out. The module is implemented under the European Statistical System agreement and under the agreement between the national statistical institute of Bulgaria and Eurostat. The main risk of adequate coverage of migrant population in conducting of 2014 AHM relates to the small number of migrants in the sampling frame (Population Census) and migrants could be not well represented in the LFS sample.

Sample design and sample size

The sample used for the survey is a stratified two-stage cluster sample. The stratification is done by districts and urban/rural areas, i.e. the sample consists of 56 strata. Clusters on the first stage are enumeration districts (established during Population Census) and clusters on the second stage are households. The sample consists of 2 438 clusters (enumeration districts) and 19 504 households. Clusters on the first stage are chosen with probability proportional to the size of district's population. For each quarter 8 households are systematically selected within each enumeration district. The sample is rotational. A 2-(2)-2 rotation pattern is used. Respondents are interviewed in two consecutive quarters, then are temporarily removed for the next two quarters and entered again for the following two quarters, i.e. each household is interviewed four times.

Sources of information

The data for persons, members of the selected households, are collected by face-to-face interview using the questionnaire. The survey collects data on economic activity of the interviewed persons by age, sex, education, urban/rural areas, marital status and occupation. For the unemployed information on the duration of unemployment, methods of job search, existence of previous work experience, etc. is also recorded.

Periodicity

Labour Force Survey in Bulgaria was conducted for the first time in September 1993. From 1994 until the end of 1999, it was conducted two or three times a year, and during the period 2000 - 2002 - four times a year (in March, June, September and December). The reference period is a fixed calendar week running from Monday to Sunday and is the same for all households.

Since the beginning of 2003 quarterly continuous Labour force survey is implemented. In case of the continuous survey all households, covered in the sample, are surveyed within three months, the sample being evenly spread throughout the quarter. The reference period is a calendar week and it is not the same for separate groups of households.

Main statistical indicators

Main analytical indicators calculated from the Labour force survey data are the following:

- Activity rate - ratio between economically active population and the total population of the same age.
- Employment rate - ratio between employed population and the total population of the same age.
- Unemployment rate - ratio between unemployed persons and the economically active population (labour force).
 - ***Steps towards increasing the availability/coverage of foreigners by mitigating the language barriers during the fieldwork***

The measures to make the LFS questionnaire available to foreigners are taken. The original questionnaire is translated in English and interviewers are able to use it for the foreign speaking respondents. The translation and additional assistance for foreign respondents can be assured in particular cases since emigration in Bulgaria is very low.

- ***Steps towards boosting the immigrant sub-sample and adjusting it to the real territorial distribution of emigrants***

Sample design and sample size

The sample is designed for the aim and purpose of LFS, i.e. to measure the labour market economic indicators. Any sample size and design changes have to be estimate very precisely and nevertheless the immigrant's related variables could not be part of LFS. The specific surveys are more reliable source.

The sample used for the survey is a stratified two-stage cluster sample. The stratification is done by districts and urban/rural areas, i.e. the sample consists of 56 strata. Clusters on the first stage are enumeration districts (established during Population Census) and clusters on the second stage are households. The sample consists of 2 438 clusters (enumeration districts) and 19 504 households. Clusters on the first stage are chosen with probability proportional to the size of district's population. For each quarter 8 households are systematically selected within each enumeration district. The sample is rotational. A 2-(2)-2 rotation pattern is used. Respondents are interviewed in two consecutive quarters, then are temporarily removed for the next two quarters and entered again for the following two quarters, i.e. each household is interviewed four times.

- ***Steps towards the standardization of concepts for identifying foreign-born population***

Concepts are already standardized.

- ***Steps towards the inclusion of supplementary questions regarding emigration or labour force out-migration***

In LFS supplementary questions are leading to an increase of respondents' burden and could influence the information on labour force variables.

- ***Steps towards the harmonization and wider selection of non-response codes, in order to identify when the whole household went abroad***

The inclusion of additional codes to better identify when the reason of non-response is moving abroad should be considered as an option but the information collected could not be used as statistically reliable information.

Conclusions

The LFS in Bulgaria is fully harmonized with legal regulations of European Union. It is coordinated by Eurostat based on recommendations of ILO. Foreign-born population and immigrants are identified through the questions on citizenship and country of birth of foreigners living or planning to live in the country more than 1 year (except diplomatic personnel, foreign representatives and members of their families). Nevertheless at present (low number of foreigners in Bulgaria and at the labour market) there is no possibility to obtain reliable statistical data on immigrants and LFS is not used as source of data on immigration.

The main problem connected to non-nationals in the Bulgarian LFS results from the small number of non-nationals in the sampling frame (Population Census). According to the 2001 Population Census (base for the 2001 - 2011 LFS samples) their number was 25.6 thousand, representing 0.3% of the total population. Due to the last, the non-nationals could not be well represented in the LFS sample and consequently LFS does not provide reliable data on immigrants' number and characteristics.

LFS does not provide data on emigration as persons who leave the country before a period of 1 year and more, as well as persons who permanently live abroad, no matter the period of migration and citizenship are not considered household members.

3.3. Migrant-specific surveys

- ***How could systematic, internationally standardized, survey-based migration-related data collection be introduced***

Systematic, Internationally standardized surveys on migration could be introduced as modules to already existing large-scale survey. The problem with such kind of surveys is that they will contribute more to a proper understanding of immigration processes in each separate country than to help production of accurate numbers both of immigrants or emigrants. Moreover, in order to produce reliable information the sample sizes have to be big enough which requires considerable financial resources. Even so it will be easier to carry out survey on immigrants in the destination country than on own emigrants in other countries.

Nevertheless, conduction of standardized migration surveys will be useful from the point of view of comparing the results from different countries and better understanding of the nature of migration to and out of separate countries. Elaboration and organisation of such kind of survey requires an international consensus to be achieved between the National statistical offices or the respective data collecting institutions first and Eurostat or other international organisation(s) second, as well as technical support and methodological guidelines.

•How could surveys be designed at transnational, national and on a local level

The better approach for conduction of migration related surveys seems to be focusing on separate migrant categories - immigrants and emigrants. Connected to this and as far as national surveys are concerned, most reasonable seems the conduction of specialised immigration survey. As the information on immigrants in Bulgaria is available in the PR or could be obtained from the Information System Demography (ISD) it seems possible such a survey to be organised. Again the problem of the amount of resources needed for the data collection and organisation is the most important. Taking into account the relatively low number of immigrants residing in the country it should be decided carefully whether such data collection is necessary in the coming years or not. The decision should be taken at the NSI top management level after a wide-scale discussion with representatives of other government institutions and possibly representatives of academic society. If agreed on the necessity of such survey, it has to be included in the National Programme for Statistical Surveys and needed resources to be ensured.

On the other side, survey focusing on emigrants will be much more useful for Bulgaria as it is a “sending” country. Organisation and conduction of such a survey is not considered acceptable at present. The main restrictions here are the lack of contact information on Bulgarian emigrants residing abroad and the expected low response rates. That’s why the main efforts still are directed to improve the coverage of emigration from the country as described in 3.1, based on any kind of official registration i.e. administrative data sources.

Other - supplementary surveys helping better estimates of migration and policy decisions in the field

1. Territorial mobility of the population (2001) and Migration and migratory behaviour of the population (2011)

NSI of Bulgaria has a good experience in conducting migration surveys mainly oriented to the migratory behaviour and attitudes than to production of migrant numbers. These kinds of surveys are quite useful for proper understanding of the people’s motives and reasons for migration. The last two migration surveys were conducted in the census years, 2001 and 2011 respectively. These were sample surveys, conducted in parallel to the census. The sample size of the two surveys was representative for the country. The purpose was to describe the migration behaviour and intentions for migration. Questions included aimed to collect information on the size, intensity and directions of internal and international migration; the social-demographic characteristics of migrants; changes in the character and the tendencies in development of internal and international migration; factors predefining the migratory behaviour of population; expectations in respect internal and international migration.

The 2011 Migration survey covered persons aged 15 years and more, no matter migrated or not during the previous years. Only persons classified as usually resident population were surveyed. The sample was stratified by residence – urban/rural. The sample size was 28 thousand persons.

In order to distinguish better the migrants depending on their predisposition and readiness for migration the following 5 groups were created in respect the potential emigrants:

- Potential emigrants – persons who are likely to migrate abroad;
- Labour emigrants – persons who are likely to migrate abroad in order to find a job/to study for more than 1 year;
- Short-term migrants - persons who are likely to migrate abroad in order to find a job/to study for a period no longer than 1 year;
- Tourists and visitors - persons who are likely to go abroad as tourist, to visit friends or relatives;
- Not traveling abroad – persons who would like to go abroad, but consider these intentions as unlikely during the next years.

The first two groups were considered as long-term potential emigrants.

Based on persons PIN (used both in the census questionnaire and in the migration one), a possibility was provided to link the data gathered during the survey with the data available in the ISD, thus allowing in depth analysis of the socio-demographic profile of migrants.

Analysis of the results achieved was based on use of multi-dimension tables with leading indicators – the created secondary indicators. The results were distributed by respondents' residence (total for the country, urban, rural), by age, sex, education, marital status, economic activity, ethnic group and others.

Based on the survey's results, the positive and negative influence of the migration on the development of the society were estimated and analysed, on different population categories, on the future demographic situation in the country, on the labour force and labour market, on the economy as a whole.

The expectations are that a migration survey will be included in the 2021 census programme. This question is to be decided by the NSI top management and the team of experts involved into the preparation of next census.

2. Sample survey on Bulgarian and Foreign Citizens, Departing from Bulgaria, conducted by the NSI

A specialised study on Bulgarian and foreign citizens, departing/arriving from/to Bulgaria is carried out on a monthly basis by the NSI. The study is conducted following the provisions of the Regulation (EC) 862/2007 on migration and Regulation (EC) 692/2011 on tourism statistics for providing data on external migration and international tourism.

The survey ensures statistical data on the trips of Bulgarian citizens travelling abroad and visits of foreigners in Bulgaria, obtained based on monthly information received from the Ministry of Interior and the sample survey carried out by the NSI among Bulgarian and foreign citizens passing the border check points.

Three main airports and 5 land border check-points with the neighboring countries (Greece, Macedonia, Romania, Serbia and Turkey) are included in the sample, where about 80% of the passengers flow is concentrated.

The survey data is used for production of more precise estimates on emigration and especially for distributing emigrants received based on NRA data by destination countries, as the last is not gathered by the NRA. Specific groups of respondents are chosen, according to their answers to questions on the purpose of trip and length of intended stay. In particular, the NRA data on persons who declare interruption of payment of health insurance contributions due to departure for a period longer than 183 days are weighted in order to produce distribution of emigrants by destination countries or if necessary some other characteristics of migrants.

3.4. Census

•Steps towards the harmonization of questions referring to migration history

Questions referring to migration history were included in the census in compliance with EU Regulation (EC) No 763/2008 and harmonization required was already achieved.

•Steps towards the inclusion supplementary questions regarding immigration (legal status of foreign nationals at the date of arrival and at the time of the census; date of acquiring citizenship; recording all citizenships/in the case of individuals with multiple citizenship; country of birth or former citizenship of parents)

The number of immigrants in Bulgaria is relatively low. Along with this, great amount of information on immigrants is already available in the national administrative registers. So, the first step to do will be to investigate in depth the information existing in separate administrative registers for information on these variables thus saving resources for production of the required data. Later, if found impossible to ensure data on the above mentioned variables based on registers information, the inclusion of supplementary questions regarding immigration will be suggested. The issue is not discussed at NSI management level yet, but will be directed to the 2021 census team for final decision.

3.5. Other

Considering that the population and migration statistics at the NSI are fully based on official administrative records, the improvement of registration in different national registers is of primary importance. That's why the main efforts of the NSI experts are directed to improve coordination with other institutions, to agree in advance the necessities of data, to harmonize the concepts, definitions and nomenclatures applied at separate administrations. In addition, changes in legislation are discussed aiming better coverage of target populations. An important issue in this direction is the creation of incentives for people to inform the respective authorities when leaving or returning to the country. Improvement of the registration will contribute to production of better estimates not only of migrants, but also of population as a whole. Questions concerning possible amendments of legislation aiming better registration are already discussed at experts' level at inter-institutional meetings.

The tables below summarises the activities foreseen for improving quality of migration statistics in the country.

Table 1: Overview table of the activities related to the WP4 Transnational Database

Activities	Level of intervention	Relevant stakeholder	Legal basis	Previous attempt for this type of intervention? If yes, why did not happen?	Possible difficulties	Rank of suggestion
Possible construction of a national developmental database on migration, labour market and human capital	national	NSI, SEEMIG partners, NSOs		No	Insufficient financial and human resources	2
Possible construction of local databases on migration, labour market and human capital	local	Local authorities		No	Insufficient financial and human resources	3
Maintenance of SEEMIG transnational databases beyond SEEMIG's lifespan	Institutional	NSOs				2

Table 2: Overview table of the WP4 Summary report suggestions

Data source type	Activities	Level of intervention	Relevant stakeholder	Legal basis	Previous attempt for this type of intervention? If yes, why did not happen?	Possible difficulties	Rank of suggestion
Administrative data sources	• Legal authorization of the access of the relevant statistical offices/ institution to individual data						
	- based on agreements with separate data owners	Institutional	Institutions maintaining own data bases, NSI	bilateral agreements	Yes, more institutions are to be involved	comparability problems, information to be exchanged, mode and periodicity of data exchange	1
	- exchange of individual data at EU level	international	NSOs, Eurostat	European legislation	no	data protection issues	1

Data source type	Activities	Level of intervention	Relevant stakeholder	Legal basis	Previous attempt for this type of intervention? If yes, why did not happen?	Possible difficulties	Rank of suggestion
	•Steps toward creating better integrated data sources (integrated data sets, parallel use of several data sources)						
	• Steps toward the introduction of PINs (if planned)						
	•Steps toward a better knowledge of data producers/users of relevant legal regulations with regard to emigration and immigration (e.g. repeated trainings)						
	• Steps toward the harmonization of definitions in different migration data sets						
	- unification of indicators, definitions and nomenclatures used at different data owners	National, data owners	NSI, data owners	bilateral agreements	Yes, more institutions are to be involved	different purposes of the operating registers	1
	• Steps toward improving data collection procedure, increase coverage and quality of data, updating the databases						
	- investigating possible new data sources and modes for data exchange	National, data owners	NSI, data owners	bilateral agreements	Yes, more institutions are to be involved	time-consuming procedures to ensure access	1
	• Steps toward the inclusion of migration-related questions into administrative and statistical data collections (e.g. country of birth, country of birth of parents etc.).						
	• Steps toward making better estimates						
	• Steps toward the improvement of data production process between phases of data provision for authorities till the phase of data publication (e.g. providing help for migrants when submitting various applications)						
	OTHER: please specify.						
Labour Force Survey -	• Steps toward increasing the availability/coverage of foreigners by mitigating the language barriers during the fieldwork	The original questionnaire is translated in English and interviewers are able to					

Data source type	Activities	Level of intervention	Relevant stakeholder	Legal basis	Previous attempt for this type of intervention? If yes, why did not happen?	Possible difficulties	Rank of suggestion
		use it for the foreign speaking respondents. The translation and additional assistance for foreign respondents can be assured in particular cases since emigration in Bulgaria is very low.					
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Steps toward boosting the immigrant sub-sample and adjusting it to the real territorial distribution of immigrants 	The sample is designed for the aim and purpose of LFS and any sample size and design changes have to be estimate very precisely				The specific surveys are more reliable source.	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Steps toward the harmonization of the definition of household membership 	The definition is already standardized					

Data source type	Activities	Level of intervention	Relevant stakeholder	Legal basis	Previous attempt for this type of intervention? If yes, why did not happen?	Possible difficulties	Rank of suggestion
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Steps toward the standardization of concepts for identifying foreign-born population 	The concepts are standardized					
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Steps toward the inclusion of supplementary questions regarding emigration or labour force out-migration 					In LFS supplementary questions are leading to an increase of respondents' burden and could influence the information on labour force variables.	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Steps toward the harmonization and wider selection of non-response codes, in order to identify when the whole household went abroad. 	The inclusion of additional codes to better identify when the reason of non-response is moving abroad should be considered as an option.	NSI			The information collected could not be used as statistically reliable information.	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Possibilities of using SEEMIG pilot methods (formulating new, constant LFS questions concerning outmigration) 					There is no relevant experience.	
	OTHER: please specify.						
Migrant-specific surveys	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> How could systematic, internationally standardized, survey-based migration-related data collection be introduced 						
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> specialised migration survey or through modules to already existing large-scale surveys 	Eurostat	Eurostat, NSOs,	EU regulation		insufficient sample size, financial resources, respondents burden	2
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> How could surveys be designed at transnational, national and on a local level 						

Data source type	Activities	Level of intervention	Relevant stakeholder	Legal basis	Previous attempt for this type of intervention? If yes, why did not happen?	Possible difficulties	Rank of suggestion
	- focused on separate migrant categories (emigrants, immigrants)	NSOs, Eurostat	NSOs, Eurostat			lack of contact information, low response rates	3
	• Possibilities of planning modules for already existing international surveys (for instance related to outmigration)						
	- in depth analysis of the information produced based on LFS module on migration have to be conducted first	national	NSI			insufficient sample size, small number of migrants observed	2
	• Steps toward setting up longitudinal migration relevant survey						
	OTHER: supplementary migration surveys	national	NSOs				2
Census	•Steps toward the harmonization of questions referring to migration history						
	•Steps toward the inclusion supplementary questions regarding immigration (legal status of foreign nationals at the date of arrival and at the time of the census; date of acquiring citizenship; recording all citizenships/in the case of individuals with multiple citizenship; country of birth or former citizenship of parents)						
	- considering the small number of immigrants, national administrative registers to be investigated for information on these variables	national	NSI	national census legislation		different nomenclatures used, data quality problems	2
	• Steps toward enhancing data on emigration and inclusion of supplementary questions regarding out-migration & return migration.						
	OTHER:						
Other	Please include any other suggestions not included in the WP4 Summary report!						
	- creating legal incentives for people to deregister/register when leaving/return to the country	national	government, NSI	amendments of existing national legislation	Yes, additional incentives to be created		1

4. LOCAL LEVEL ACTIVITIES FOR MIGRATION DATA IMPROVEMENTS

- ***Setting up local developmental databases***

The improvement of national migration data could not be efficient if there is no improvement at local level data availability. The national approach of use of different data sources should be applied at the regional and local level also.

- The first step is the investigation of possible new data sources and modes for data exchange:

As there are various regional institutions collecting data, such as Civil registration service, Employment Bureau, Health Insurance Office the focus at the local NUTS 3 level will be in gathering the data collected from these various institutions in order to get a complete regional overview of data.

Apart from the above mentioned administrative data the Regional Statistical Bureau collect and disseminate data on demographics, labour market and economical information at NUTS 3 and LAU 2 level.

The reliability of data has to be investigated and the overview of the methodologies and data collection methods used by various institutions will help for local level migration data improvements.

The defying the steps toward making data estimates are the important step at local level.

- Possible construction of local databases on migration, labour market and human capital

The possibilities of local data bases construction depend on data quality estimations, procedures on data exchange and the legal requirements for them and to the great extent on financial resources availability.

- Capacity building at local governments

In a period of one year the most possible capacity improvement is a result of better understanding and communication on existing data on migration and the knowledge gained within the SEEMIG activities. The active participation at workshops and master classes of all stakeholders at regional level is decisive for capacity building.